

CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION

This project focused on establishing the historic context for the commercial buildings in West Hollywood from its initial development in the 1890s through its incorporation as a city in 1984. The scope included a historic resources survey to identify all existing resources constructed through 1975 that may be eligible for local, state, or national designation within this context in West Hollywood. Eligibility guidelines were developed for associated property types to assist with the evaluation of properties identified as potential historic resources during the survey and the possible designation of properties by the City of West Hollywood in the future. The eligibility guidelines were based on the criteria set forth in the National Register of Historic Places (National Register), California Register of Historical Resources (California Register), and West Hollywood Register of Cultural Resources (West Hollywood Register or Local Register). Thus, an understanding of each of these designation programs is critical to using and interpreting this document. The following is a discussion of each of the programs.

National Register of Historic Places

The National Register is “an authoritative guide to be used by federal, state, and local governments, private groups and citizens to identify the nation's cultural resources and to indicate what properties should be considered for protection from destruction or impairment.”²

CRITERIA

To be eligible for listing in the National Register, a property must be at least 50 years of age and possess significance in American history and culture, architecture, or archaeology. A property of potential significance must meet one or more of four established criteria:³

- A. Associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- B. Associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or
- C. Embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
- D. Yield, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

²Title 36 Code of Federal Regulations Part 60.2.

³Title 36 Code of Federal Regulations Part 60.4.

INTEGRITY

Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance. To be listed in the National Register, a property must not only be shown to be significant under the criteria, but it also must have integrity. The evaluation of integrity is grounded in an understanding of a property's physical features and how they relate to its significance. The California Office of Historic Preservation and the City of West Hollywood utilize the same aspects of integrity as the National Register.

Historic properties either retain integrity (that is, convey their significance) or they do not. Within the concept of integrity, the National Register criteria recognize seven aspects or qualities that, in various combinations, define integrity. These seven aspects include location, setting, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association. To retain historic integrity a property will always possess several, and usually most, of the aspects. The retention of specific aspects of integrity is paramount for a property to convey its significance. Determining which of these aspects are most important to a particular property requires knowing why, where, and when the property is significant. The seven aspects of integrity are defined as follows:

- Location is the place where the historic property was constructed or the place where the historic event occurred.
- Design is the combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style of a property.
- Setting is the physical environment of a historic property.
- Materials are the physical elements that were combined or deposited during a particular period of time and in a particular pattern or configuration to form a historic property.
- Workmanship is the physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history or prehistory.
- Feeling is a property's expression of the aesthetic or historic sense of a particular period of time.
- Association is the direct link between an important historic event or person and a historic property.

CRITERIA CONSIDERATION G

Certain kinds of properties, like those less than 50 years of age, are not usually considered eligible for listing in the National Register. Fifty years is the general estimate of the time needed to develop historical perspective and to evaluate significance. These properties can be eligible for listing,

however, if they meet special requirements called Criteria Considerations, in addition to meeting the regular requirements. *National Register Bulletin #15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation* states that a property less than 50 years of age may be eligible for the National Register if it is of exceptional importance.⁴ Demonstrating exceptional importance requires the development of a historic context statement for the resource being evaluated, a comparative analysis with similar resources, and scholarly sources on the property type and historic context.

PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE

Period of significance refers to the span of time during which significant events and activities occurred. Events and associations with historic resources are finite; most properties have a clearly definable period of significance. For properties that are architecturally significant, the period of significance is typically the date of construction. For properties that are historically or culturally significant, the period of significance is the length of time when a property was associated with significant events, businesses, persons, or cultural groups.

As a city that was primarily built out by the mid-twentieth century, many buildings in West Hollywood were altered to accommodate changing uses decades after their initial construction. These buildings may be associated with later events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history. Consequently, the period of significance for a building may reflect an association with events that took place after construction. Alterations to the building from the period of significance will reflect this association and do not diminish integrity.

California Register of Historical Resources

In 1992, Governor Wilson signed Assembly Bill 2881 into law establishing the California Register. The California Register is an authoritative guide used by state and local agencies, private groups and citizens to identify historic resources and to indicate what properties are to be protected, to the extent prudent and feasible, from substantial adverse impacts.

The California Register consists of properties that are listed automatically as well as those that must be nominated through an application and public hearing process.⁵ The California Register automatically includes the following:

- California properties listed in the National Register and those formally Determined Eligible for the National Register;
- California Registered Historical Landmarks from No. 0770 onward; and

⁴National Register Bulletin #15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation (Washington D.C.: U.S. Department of Interior, revised 1997), 2.

⁵Public Resources Code Section 5024.1.

- Those California Points of Historical Interest that have been evaluated by the Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) and have been recommended to the State Historical Resources Commission for inclusion on the California Register.

The criteria for eligibility of listing in the California Register are based upon National Register criteria, but are identified as 1-4 instead of A-D. To be eligible for listing in the California Register, a property must be at least 50 years of age and possess significance at the local, state, or national level, under one or more of the following four criteria:

1. It is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of local or regional history, or the cultural heritage of California or the United States; or
2. It is associated with the lives of persons important to local, California, or national history; or
3. It embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values; or
4. It has yielded, or has the potential to yield, information important in the prehistory or history of the local area, California, or the nation.

Historic resources eligible for listing in the California Register may include buildings, sites, structures, objects, and historic districts. Resources less than 50 years of age may be eligible if it can be demonstrated that sufficient time has passed to understand its historical importance. While the enabling legislation for the California Register is less rigorous with regard to the issue of integrity, there is the expectation that properties reflect their appearance during their period of significance.⁶

West Hollywood Register of Cultural Resources

Chapter 19.58 of West Hollywood Municipal Code, commonly known as the City's Cultural Heritage Preservation Ordinance, identifies the criteria under which a property or collection of properties may be added to the West Hollywood Register of Cultural Resources. Properties may be designated a cultural resource or historic district by the City Council following the recommendation of the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC). HPC recommends the designation of cultural resources and historic districts if they possess significance and retain integrity. To be significant, properties must meet one of the following designation criteria:

- A) Exemplifies Special Elements of the City - It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city's aesthetic, architectural, cultural, economic, engineering, political, natural, or social history and possesses an integrity of design, location, materials, setting, workmanship feeling, and association in the following manner:

⁶ Public Resources Code Section 4852.

- 1) It embodies distinctive characteristics of a period, method, style, or type of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship; or
 - 2) It contributes to the significance of a historic area by being:
 - (a) A geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic or scenic properties; or
 - (b) A thematically related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by plan or physical development; or
 - 3) It reflects significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of growth and settlement, particular transportation modes, or distinctive examples of community or park planning; or
 - 4) It embodies elements of architectural design, craftsmanship, detail, or materials that represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation; or
 - 5) It has a unique location or singular physical characteristic or is a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the city; or
- B) Example of Distinguishing Characteristics - It is one of the few remaining examples in the city, region, state or nation, possessing distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or historical type or specimen; or
- C) Identified with Persons or Events - It is identified with persons or events significant in local, state, or national history; or
- D) Notable Work - It is representative of the work of a notable architect, builder, or designer.

California Historical Resource Status Codes

The California Historical Resource Status Codes are codes that were created by the California Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) to classify historic resources in the state's inventory. Status codes are three-digit evaluation codes for use in classifying potential cultural resources. The first digit indicates the general category of evaluation. The letter code indicates whether the resource is separately eligible (S), eligible as part of a district (D), or both (B). The third digit is a code that describes some of the circumstances or conditions of the evaluation.⁷

During the survey, all properties identified as potential historic resources and documented on DPR forms were assigned a California Historical Resource Status Code. Designated historic resources had previously assigned status codes and this information was entered into the RuskinARC database. Relevant status codes for the West Hollywood Commercial Resources Survey are listed below and repeated in Appendix I.

⁷For a complete list of California Historical Resource Status Codes, please see: State of California, Office of Historic Preservation, "Historical Resource Status Codes," December 8, 2003. Accessed August 4, 2016, http://ohp.parks.ca.gov/pages/1069/files/chrstatus_codes.pdf.

**California Historical Resource Status Codes in
City of West Hollywood Commercial Historic Resources Survey**

- 1S Individual property listed in the National Register by the National Park Service. Listed in the California Register.
- 2S2 Individual property determined eligible for the National Register by consensus with a federal agency. Listed in the California Register.
- 3CS Appears eligible for California Register as an individual property through survey evaluation.
- 3D Appears eligible for National Register as a contributor to an eligible district through survey evaluation.
- 3S Appears eligible for National Register as an individual property through survey evaluation.
- 5D1 Contributor to a district that is listed or designated locally.
- 5D2 Contributor to a district that is eligible for local listing or designation.
- 5D3 Appears eligible for local listing or designation as a contributor to an eligible district through survey evaluation.
- 5S1 Individual property listed or designated locally.
- 5S3 Appears eligible for local listing or designation as an individual property through survey evaluation.
- 6L Determined ineligible for local listing or designation through local government review process; may warrant special consideration in local planning.
- 6Z Found ineligible for the National Register, California Register, or local designation through survey evaluation.
- 7N Needs to be re-evaluated.